
Argumentative Writing: Analytic Comparisons
Analytic Comparisons of Middle School Students Use of Evidence

Analytic Comparison: Evidence – Alignment

Evidence ‘alignment’ refers to the closeness of the connection between the evidence and the argumentative claim that it supports. Educational standards sometimes refer to this as ‘relevance’ – is the evidence closely connected to the argumentative claim? Is it highly relevant to the claim? Or is there a material gap between the argumentative claim and the what the evidence says or supports?

A) Argumentative claim: Immigration will lead to resource shortages in the United States

According to ‘Overpopulation: Causes, Effects, and Solutions- Conserve Energy Future’ 2013, “Those engaged in talking about overpopulation have noticed that acts of violence and aggression outside of a war zone have increased tremendously while competing for resources.”

B) Argumentative claim: Immigration leads to valuable cultural diversity

As Defending Immigrant Rights: An Activist Resource Kit, PublicEye, published in 2002, has made it clear “New immigrants have always had a dynamic relationship to U.S. society, adapting to its diverse cultures and values, just as the society adapts to the immigrants, their traditions and perspectives.”

C) Argumentative claim: School uniforms restrict student free expression

Another important observation has been made by researchers at the University of Nevada. They found that 90% of seventh and eighth grade public school students oppose to wearing school uniforms. So, in other words, students in seventh and eighth grade didn’t like wearing school uniforms. They said 81% middle school students said uniforms did not reduce fights. 76% said that wearing school uniforms did not help them fit in at school.

Argumentative Writing: Analytic Comparisons

Analytic Comparisons of Middle School Students Use of Evidence

Analytic Comparison: Evidence – Reasoning

Evidence reasoning refers to the quality and the cogency of the explanation provided by the writer as to how the evidence proves the argumentative claim true. Evidence doesn't speak for itself; writers of academic argument must be explicit in reasoning from the evidence back to the argumentative claim and overall position.

A) Argumentative claim: Uniforms can negative affect students' body image

Arizona State University agrees when stating it can affect body images because they found that “students from schools without uniforms reported higher self-perception scores than students from schools with uniform policies.” The essence of Robyn Silverman's view-point here is that some students find uniforms less comfortable than their regular clothes, which may not be conducive to learning.

B) Argumentative claim: Immigration leads to valuable cultural diversity

Jeffrey Miron, Psychology Today, on July 12, 2010 agrees when stating “Immigration may change cultural values or norms, but nothing suggests this is a negative. Many societies flourish because they have incorporated new businesses, cultures, foods, and so on. More important, immigrants normally assimilate to the pre-existing culture provided government policy does not segregate them from the rest of society...” The essence of Jeffrey Miron's viewpoint here is that we as a nation, accepted the cultures of immigrants. Also that if we let them come to the nation, then we can build a better friendship with each other and teach each other different experience that we couldn't learned.

Argumentative Writing: Analytic Comparisons

Analytic Comparisons of Middle School Students Use of Evidence

Analytic Comparison: Evidence – Sufficiency

Evidence 'sufficiency' refers to whether the evidence presented to support the argumentative claim is extensive enough to convince the reader or listener that the claim is likely to be true. Often times, this means that there is more than one example or data point to support the claim, that the evidence presented proves a pattern of proof. When working with textual evidence this can mean more than one piece of it strongly supports the claim.

A) Argumentative claim: School uniforms infringe on student self-expression

One important reason that school uniforms should not be required by schools is that with uniforms students are not able to show their true colors. According to hiline.cfschools.org, "cutting that off [unique character] at a young age only stifles creativity and encourages conformity." What Brian Winkel is saying here is when students can't have their own expression it makes them stay the same. Another important observation has been made by discoverygirls.org by Maryam. "I've learned that sometimes uniforms make you feel equal but they can also make you less independent because your clothes are like everyone else's. So, in other words school uniforms are all the same which does not allow the environment around you see who you really are."

B) Argumentative claim: Allowing assisted suicide leads to an increase in euthanasia

One reason that assisted suicide should not be ~~allowed~~^{allowed} is that there will be an increase in the use of euthanasia. From www.lifenews.com they explain "Assisted suicide has increased by 44% in Oregon." That is a huge increase and will take many lives. I wonder if lawmakers have seen this increase for this would clearly show them that making euthanasia legal would be a horrid decision to make. With this drastic raise in the use of assisted suicide it surprises me that people are not trying to help stop the problem not to mention the fact that people are trying to make it worse. ^

Argumentative Writing: Analytic Comparisons Analytic Comparisons of Middle School Students Use of Evidence

Analytic Comparison: Evidence – Credibility

Evidence ‘credibility’ refers to both the qualifications and expertise of the source of the evidence, *and* the warrants that provide a basis for the evidence’s believability within the text of the evidence itself.

A) Argumentative claim: Assisted suicide increases familial grief

At www.childmind.org agree when they state, “when a parent dies it’s always painful for a child, and a parents death by suicide -especially, reaserch shows, a mothers death- has an even more painful and potential effect.” This shows a parent’s

suicide has a greater effect on a child or family member. C

B) Argumentative claim: Immigration improves the economy

According to Immigration Policy Center on Tuesday, April 09, 2013, “Recent studies suggest that the economic value of a new legalization program would be substantial, amounting to tens of billions of dollars in added income, billions of dollars in addition of tax revenue and hundreds of thousands of new jobs of native-born and immigrant workers alike.” What Immigration Policy Center is saying here is that all or most states will get additional money and taxes. Also can create more jobs that will improve the economy