|Counter-Argument

Response or Refutation

Counter-Claim: (One potential reason your position isn't true)

Reparations are unjust because they punish current generations for the crimes and the sins of previous generations.

Backing for Counter-Claim: (Evidence and reasoning to support CC)

The biggest historical crime committed against African-Americans, and against their property, was slavery. But slavery was ended in the U.S. more than 150 years ago. No one alive today had any role in promoting or benefiting from slavery. And even if there are forms of institutional racism today that whites benefit from, they do not have anything close to the impact not only of slavery, but of Jim Crow segregation laws that followed slavery and were ended by the Civil Rights Movement, which itself came to an end about 50 years ago. Here, too, crimes of segregation should not be blamed on current generations.

Transition Word or Phrase (either a single transition or a summary of the CA): While they may not accord with a standard of perfect justice,

Newly Formulated Claim: (responding to the CA) Reparations are still more just than unjust.

Evidence+ Reasoning or Critique of CA (explain why your response is stronger):

According to the NAACP ("The Legacy of Institutional Racism," 2015), a quantifiable percentage of current white families' wealth in the U.S. (as high as 20%) is attributable to the property crimes inflicted on African-Americans in previous generations. The biggest crime, of course, is slavery, but systemic evictions and worker exploitation that predominated during the period of enforced segregation in America (1865 – 1965) swelled the affluence of white people far beyond what it would have been otherwise. This affluence has been passed down through generations, partially in the form of higher education, better neighborhoods, and direct inheritances. This means that the *current generation of white people* in the U.S. has a moral and even legal responsibility to turn over a portion of their assets for the previous generations' crimes. Even if the exact numbers cannot be perfectly determined, it is more just than unjust for reparations to be paid.